Heritage Assessment

Simpson & Brown Architects
October 2009
Contents

1.0 INTRODUCTION 3
1.1 Objectives 3
1.2 Study Area 3
1.3 Designations 5
1.4 Site Inspection & Research 5
1.5 Abbreviations 5

2.0 HISTORICAL DEVELOPMENT 6
2.1 Early Development 6
2.2 The Development of Grainger Town 7
2.3 67 Clayton Street 11
2.4 The Newgate Shopping Centre and Hotel 14
2.5 Modernist Renewal in Newcastle – the era of T Dan Smith 21
2.6 Previous Buildings on the Site 22

3.0 NEIGHBOURING LISTED BUILDINGS 26
3.1.1 The Assembly Rooms, Fenkle Street 26
3.1.2 County Court Buildings & 23 Westgate Road 27
3.1.3 19-25 Grainger Street 27
3.1.4 Church of St John the Baptist 28
3.1.5 30 Grainger Street 28
3.1.6 34-50 Grainger Street 28
3.1.7 53-61 Grainger Street, Chaucer buildings 28
3.1.8 2-20 Newgate Street 28
3.1.9 69 & 71 Clayton Street 29
3.1.10 85-107 Clayton Street 29
3.1.11 Rose & Crown Public House 29
3.1.12 73-75 Grainger Street 29
3.2 Summary 30

4.0 COMPARITIVE ANALYSIS 31
4.1 Other Modernist Developments 31
4.2 Summary 32

5.0 ARCHITECTS’ BIOGRAPHIES 33
5.1 John Wardle 33
5.2 Oliver and Leeson 33
5.3 Frank Matcham 33
5.4 Bernard Engle & Partners 33
6.0 CONDITION
  6.1 Condition & Repairs

7.0 IMPACT ASSESSMENT
  7.1 Introduction
  7.2 Identification of Impact
  7.3 Evaluation of Significance
  7.4 Mitigation
  7.5 Residual Impacts
  7.6 Summary

8.0 RECOMMENDATIONS
  8.1 Key Recommendations
  8.2 Retention of Significance
  8.3 Further Research
  8.4 Physical Evidence & Recording
  8.5 Repairs
  8.6 Interventions: New Shop Front
  8.7 The Design of New Buildings
1.0 INTRODUCTION

1.1 Objectives

This document has been commissioned by Flamewall Ltd. who own the buildings within the study area assessed within this report.

The document is intended to accompany the application for Listed Building Consent for alterations to 67 Clayton Street which is part of the study area, and Conservation Area Consent. Parts of the assessment will also be included in an overall Environmental Statement being collated by Nathaniel Lichfield & Partners which will accompany the application for planning permission to demolish the majority of the buildings within the study area and to redevelop the area to designs by Devereux Architects.

As the redevelopment of 67 Clayton Street and the redevelopment of the remainder of the study area are linked, this document looks at both aspects in order to gain a greater understanding of the heritage impact of the whole redevelopment project.

1.2 Study Area

The site is approximately 0.7 hectares in area and has frontages onto Newgate Street, Clayton Street and Grainger Street. It is currently occupied by the Newgate Shopping Centre, office floor space and the former Quality Hotel, currently operating as the Newgate Hotel. The site is bound as follows:

- To the north-east by Newgate Street;
- To the south-east by Grainger Street;
- To the south and south-west by Falconar’s Court and the rear of the Assembly Rooms;
- To the north-west by Clayton Street and the rear of the former Woolworths store.

Figure 1 OS Map showing study area. OS/M ultimap
Figure 2  Map showing location of study area with the Central Conservation Area boundary. 
Newcastle City Council

Figure 3  Oblique aerial view from the WSW with the study area outlined. Courtesy of Devereux Architects
1.3 Designations
The study area is within the Central Conservation Area boundary - see figure 2. Reference has been made whilst carrying out research for this assessment to the 1996 character appraisal of the Conservation Area titled Patterns of Experience. In planning terms the site lies within the Core Shopping area of Newcastle City Centre and a Site or Area of Archaeological Interest as defined by the Newcastle Unitary Development Plan (UDP). The study area includes 67 Clayton Street which is Grade II Listed by English Heritage. No other part of the study area is listed, but it is in the immediate vicinity of several other statutorily listed and locally listed buildings, as detailed in part 3 of this study. These include 61 Grainger Street, 71 Clayton Street and the Old Assembly Rooms.

1.4 Site Inspection & Research
A site visit was conducted by Simpson & Brown on Monday 5 October. This was accompanied by Steve Halsall of Devereux Architects. This site visit was followed by an additional site visit on Monday 12 October.

Documentary research has been carried out for this report, however given the relatively short timeframe in completing the report, it is likely that more information may be available. We consider that sufficient research was undertaken for the purposes of this report, however it is accepted that further research may add to the understanding of the historical development of the site.

1.5 Abbreviations
The following abbreviations have been used throughout this report.

NCC    Newcastle City Council
EH     English Heritage
S&B    Simpson & Brown Architects
RCAHMS The Royal Commission on the Ancient and Historical Monuments of Scotland
TWAS   Tyne & Wear Archives Service
OS     Ordnance Survey
2.0 HISTORICAL DEVELOPMENT

2.1 Early Development

Figure 4 1610 map of Newcastle. Note the city walls, with ‘Z’ marked as the ‘Newe Gate’ and ‘3’ marked as the ‘West gate’, with the corresponding roads leading to the centre of the town. ‘I’ is ‘Saint Johns’. http://www.picturesofgateshead.co.uk/local_maps/

Figure 5 1788 map of Newcastle. Note the city walls still in existence. http://www.picturesofgateshead.co.uk/local_maps/
2.2 The Development of Grainger Town

The redevelopment of the area is described by John Grundy and Grace McCombie in the Northumberland edition of the Buildings of England series:

“This [redevelopment] began with Richard Grainger’s purchase in 1834 of the Anderson estate, which lay within the Town Walls. Grainger had established his reputation as a Newcastle builder-developer with the building of Blackett Street and Eldon Square in 1827, designed by Thomas Oliver and John Dobson, and of the suburban Leazes Terrace and Crescent (1829-30), designed by Thomas Oliver. Grainger’s purchase of the Anderson estate proved a turning-point in the town’s architectural history; his plan to develop this large
central area, with the help of several architects and the approval of the Common Council, might be compared to the development of Edinburgh’s New Town, except that Newcastle’s ‘new town’ was within its medieval boundaries and limited by its medieval streets.

Granger’s architects were John Wardle and George Walker from his own office, John Dobson and John & Benjamin Green. A prerequisite for the new developments was the demolition of a market which the Corporation had built as recently as 1808 and its replacement by the Grainger Market, probably designed by John Dobson, with a rationally planned interior. It opened in 1835. The new centre was virtually complete by 1837, with its main thoroughfare, the gently curving Grey Street, climbing uphill past Green’s noble classical portico of the Theatre Royal (1836-7) to what became the focal point of Grainger’s scheme, the Column to Lord Grey, also designed by Green, of 1838.

Grainger and his architects brought a new sophistication to the town, and a classical grandeur combined with Picturesque planning influenced by Nash’s London developments. Where brick had reigned supreme, there were now smooth stone fronts; where details had been modest floor and sill bands and classical doorcases, there were now giant classical orders, with rusticated basements supporting giant pilasters and full entablatures.”

**Figure 8** Stitched panoramic view of the west side of Clayton Street. S&B

The surviving architecture of Clayton Street, probably by John Wardle, does not comprise ‘giant classical orders’ (the nearest example is on the corner of Bigg Market and Grainger Street), yet is clearly demonstrative of the ‘smooth stone fronts’ described above. An intentionally-designed city block thus began to appear as the new streets straddled the earlier Newgate Street and Westgate Street. The clearly identifiable Grainger Town-architecture of the 1830s contrasted with the earlier medieval-pattern urban form which it both dissected and enclosed.
This stark contrast did not last long however as even by the mid-19th century the homogenous architectural treatment of the Grainger developments began to be dissolved by later additions and alterations. Within the study area itself, the block on the south-west corner of Grainger Street and Newgate Street can be seen as a good example of a 19th century building that was arguably ‘out of context’, yet is now locally listed. This building is an important indicator of the change in tastes between the Grainger Street of the 1830s and the opening up of the southern continuation of the street in the 1860s when St John’s Lane was transformed from a ‘muddy lane’ into a grand street connecting to the Central Railway Station. The Buildings of England states that ‘classical simplicity was abandoned and the Gothic and Renaissance styles, with an abundance of carved decoration, were fervently embraced’¹.

A later building (unlisted) at the north-east corner of Newgate Street and Clayton Street can be seen as an even more bold introduction to the streetscape, with a façade of white faience tiles.

The developments with the greatest impact on this block within the conservation area were Frank Matcham’s Empire Theatre of 1903 – a grand edifice with a confident Franco-Flemish elevation that dominated the street – and the shopping centre and hotel that replaced it sixty years later.

¹ Buildings of England: Northumberland, p491
Figure 10 1898 map of Newcastle showing the completion of the city block, with ‘Grainger Street West’ forming the east boundary. Behind the new street frontages, the medieval pattern of burgage plots continues to exist, with Newgate Street retaining its distinct character.

Figure 11 South elevation of 30 Grainger Street, built in 1886 for the Newcastle & Gateshead Gas Company. S&B

Figure 12 Striking faience-tiled building at the corner of Newgate Street and Clayton Street, opposite the study area. S&B
2.3  67 Clayton Street

As stated in the Listed Building description, along with the neighbouring buildings of the same era, number 67 Clayton Street was probably designed by John Wardle. The simple ashlar-fronted elevation to Clayton Street is three-bays with diminishing window heights to third floor. There is a simple string-course band between the first and second floors and a bold cornice above the second, both of which run across numbers 69 and 71.

Whereas number 69 has lost the original pattern of sash windows, the original design is extant on number 67. The elevation is also clean of any previous paint, which remains on the adjacent building.

The shop front is a poor-quality modern intervention. It is possibly contemporary with the construction of the Newgate Centre, with the ground floor of the premises being remodelled to connect to the entrance pend of the Centre, both with extensive glazing and a direct entrance.

Alterations to the building are not exclusively from the 1960s however; building warrant drawings show alterations being made in the 19th century, including the relocation of the stair between ground and first floors, and a replacement shop front. This relocated stair was itself replaced.

The upper floor levels contain no remaining historic fabric. Although no opening up of later alterations was carried out at the time of survey, it is clear with the insertion of the stair between first and second floor levels, any original detailing from the most important interior would have been lost at that time. No fireplaces remain, and no historic joinery was found. The rear elevation of the building is devoid of any historic character.

It is clear that the only merit of the building that remains, in conservation terms, is the value of the façade in the context of a Richard Grainger-developed streetscape.
Figure 14  Approved proposed replacement shopfront of 1889. Tyne & Wear Archives

Figure 15  Ground floor plan as existing in 1889. Tyne & Wear Archives

Figure 16  Approved proposed alteration to the ground floor, showing relocated stair and replacement shopfront. Tyne & Wear Archives
Figure 17  Ground floor of 67 Clayton Street. S&B

Figure 18  First floor of 67 Clayton Street. S&B

Figure 19  Stair to second floor blocking the first floor windows of 67 Clayton Street. S&B

Figure 20  Second floor of 67 Clayton Street. S&B
2.4 The Newgate Shopping Centre & Hotel

Figure 23 above shows the study area approximately ten years before a large number of the buildings were demolished. The most notable of these was the Empire Theatre (see 2.6), yet a large number of neighbouring properties were also demolished marking the end of the historic medieval burgage plots. Also shown on the map is St John’s Works, which by this date had expanded westwards.
The shopping centre and hotel, designed by Bernard Engle & Partners, was completed by 1969. The shopping centre, all on ground floor level, was accessed via a large pend to Newgate Street, under the hotel, with ancillary entrances from both Clayton Street and Grainger Street. Car parking, loading bays, and storage were provided at basement level, accessed from Falconar’s Court. Also at basement level, accessed from within the shopping centre was a large public bar and nightclub. The shopping centre was conceived as an open air plaza, with dramatic views from the open courtyard at the centre to the hotel above. This also allowed for ventilated public conveniences to be located in the west courtyard. The hotel was designed with its primary access from the deck-level car park, with additional pedestrian access from the main Newgate Street entrance to the shopping centre. A reception and bar area was included at the entrance level (referred to as level ‘0’), with a dramatic sixth-level restaurant and cocktail bar. The 93-roomed hotel operated initially under the Swallow Hotel brand, later transferred to the Quality Hotel chain which went
into administration in January 2009. The hotel closed as a result, but was re-opened by the current owners in June 2009, and is now called the Newgate Hotel.

Figure 26  1965 drawing by Bernard Engle & Partners showing elevation of the Swallow Hotel. TWAS

Commercial office accommodation was provided in the corner block of Newgate Street and Clayton Street, and in a block that broke through to Grainger Street to the west.
In the early 1990s the open-air courtyards of the shopping centre were enclosed to become glazed atria. The public toilets were removed, and other cosmetic changes have been made to the centre in the intervening years.

The current owners, Flamewall Ltd. announced that they had purchased the site in October 2005.
Figure 29  View of the office block at the corner of Newgate Street and Clayton Street. S&B

Figure 30  View of the glazed roof above the previously open courtyard of the shopping centre, with the hotel in the background. S&B
Figure 31 Plaque marking the official opening of the Swallow Hotel in 1969. S&B

Figure 32 View of the west elevation of the hotel. Note the ribbon window to the sixth-level restaurant and bar. S&B

Figure 33 The sixth-level restaurant and bar, now used for breakfasts only. S&B

Figure 34 Sample bedroom. S&B
Figure 35  Level '0' reception area, with the principal entrance from the deck-level car park to the right. S&B
2.5 **Modernist Renewal in Newcastle - the era of T Dan Smith.**

The demolition of the Empire Theatre in 1963 occurred right in the middle of Thomas Daniel Smith’s illustrious reign as leader of Newcastle City Council. Commonly known as T Dan Smith, he was a highly controversial figure – not least for the large scale redevelopment projects that he instigated. Five years after his leadership of the council had ended he was arrested on charges of corruption – and later sentenced in 1974 to six years’ imprisonment. Despite this, his fervent efforts in promoting the North-East are still acknowledged, and although many of his schemes were controversial, particularly in their loss of noted buildings such as the Town Hall (to make way for John Dobson Street) and the Royal Arcade (to be replaced with the Pilgrim Street roundabout and Swan House), they were all part of his ambition for Newcastle to be a major cultural centre, with improved homes and amenities for the people of the city.

A recent exhibition on T Dan Smith, City State: Towards the Brasilia of the North, has re-examined the legacy of post-war redevelopment of Newcastle. It showed both extant buildings and those that have since been demolished – Westgate House and Central Library being the most prominent examples. The Newgate Street development is not included in the exhibition – perhaps an indicator of the lesser quality and significance of the architecture. The exhibition itself, like its subject, has proven controversial with one comment on the Journal Live website stating that:

“Dan Smith was a crook, a philistine and a vandal, Anyone who could destroy the Royal Arcade - an architectural gem, the Town Hall and many other beautiful buildings deserves a place in the lower reaches of hell, not an exhibition.”

---

2.6 Previous Buildings on the Site

Figure 37 ‘View of Newcastle in the Reign of Victoria’ by John Storey, 1862. TWAS

The 2nd Edition Ordnance Survey map of 1896 shows the continuing existence of the historic burgage plots. At the centre of the site, roughly on the position of the loading bay, car park and ramp, is an industrial building which replaced an earlier structure that is shown on John Storey’s view of Newcastle from 1862. This was the ‘Bumler Box’, which was ‘likened to ‘Noah’s Ark’ or ‘Hancock’s Birdcage’, but was part of an old tannery, which was later in use as an oil cloth factory – it was demolished later in the 1860s.3

St John’s Works, on the same site, lasted the next century and, as implied by the many applications for building warrants in the Tyne & Wear Archives, it was repeatedly altered and extended.

Figure 38 Elevations of St John’s Works. TWAS

Drawing in the Tyne & Wear Archives show examples of some existing and proposed elevations of buildings on Newgate Street (figures 36 & 37).

---

3 Alan Morgan, Victorian Panorama: A Visit to Newcastle Upon Tyne in the Reign of Queen Victoria
The Empire Theatre

Oliver & Leeson’s Newcastle Empire was a magnificent example of a music hall, built as an addition to The Scotch Arms public house of Newgate Street. Although relatively late in date (1890) and with a theatre stage, it retained the character of earlier drinking halls, being rectangular in plan with two tiers of balconies on three sides, and mirrors and pictures on the walls.

At ground level the essential medieval pattern of courts and building plots was maintained, with a lane running through the length of the site. This provided access to numerous stairs to the concert hall above, whilst retaining the ground floor public bar areas. It is not known what form the elevation took, but there is the possibility that the three-bay front shown in the Frank Matcham drawing (figure 42) was by Oliver and Leeson, with Matcham rebuilding everything behind and to the side.

Figure 39 A typical elevation of a building to Newgate Street within the study area. TWAS

Figure 40 Approved proposed elevation for the same plot – it is not known if it was realised. TWAS

Figure 41 1889 plans by Oliver and Leeson showing additions and alterations to the ‘Royal Scotch Arms Hotel Concert Hall’. TWAS
The Empire Theatre designed by Frank Matcham was the first wholesale redevelopment project seen in this city block, and although clearly carried out over several years, eventually erased the courts and alleyways that the Oliver and Leeson scheme had kept.

The new theatre was a Frank Matcham classic – the section of the theatre demonstrates the rich interior that had seats at stalls, dress, upper and gallery levels.

**Figure 42** Approved proposed elevation by Frank Matcham for the Empire Theatre – the outer bays were not built as shown, but to a less ambitious castellated design. TWAS

**Figure 43** Section by Frank Matcham for the Empire Theatre. TWAS
Figure 44  Dress Circle level by Frank Matcham for the Empire Theatre. TWAS

Figure 45 1904 playbill for the ‘New Empire Palace Theatre’ shortly after reopening. Note that the bay to the left was not built at this stage – Elliott’s Court was still open, as shown in the plan.

Figure 46  General view of the Empire Theatre showing the full five-bay façade completed, with the bay adjacent to the Rose & Crown Inn completed on the site of Elliott’s Court. This view appears to have been taken shortly before demolition.
3.0 NEIGHBOURING LISTED BUILDINGS

Figure 47 Map showing the location of listed buildings. Devereux Architects

The following text is arranged in a roughly counter-clockwise perambulation starting from the Assembly Rooms immediately to the south of the study area. The buildings to the east of the Assembly Rooms on Westgate Road follow before turning up Grainger Street. The buildings opposite the study area on Newgate Street are included, as are the listed buildings along Clayton Street between Newgate Road and Fenkle Street, completing the circle.

3.1.1 The Assembly Rooms, Fenkle Street (Grade II*)

Figure 48 2009 view of the Assembly Rooms (left) and the County Court building. S&B
"1774-6 by William Newton, paid for by public subscription. The ashlar façade strongly resembles Newton’s other Newcastle public building - the entrance to the Guildhall - which he designed with David Stephenson. A giant Ionic order supports the pediment over the projecting three-bay centre, all in very high-quality masonry: the sides are brick. The central door was blocked and double side doors under a canopy inserted in alterations of c1900. On the curved drive, good wrought -iron lampholders, replacements for the originals. Inside, carved chimneypieces and doorcases, classical columns (some now masked) and pilasters, and delicate stucco ceiling decoration. The subscribers were very satisfied with this setting for balls and dinners, as well as with the newsroom, where the London papers could be read on the day they were published."  

The Assembly Rooms continued in use until 1967 when the operating company went into liquidation. Initial attempts to sell the building were defeated by the apparent condition of the building – by 1974 it was suggested that the rapidly deteriorating building be demolished and the site then sold for redevelopment. However, the building was sold and refurbished for use as an events venue, with the Casino Royal occupying the Lower Ballroom from 1974 until 1998. The building is still in the same family’s ownership and is now used for private hire, conferences and weddings.

The principal relationship between the Assembly Rooms and the study area is the view from the windows of the main first-floor ballroom, referred to by the current owners as the Chandelier Suite. These windows on the rear elevation currently look on to the spiral vehicle ramp leading to the hotel car park – the likely landscaping of this area proposed within the redevelopment will both enhance any view from the Assembly Rooms, and potentially generate a greater appreciation of the building from within the study area.

3.1.2 County Court Building and Number 52 Westgate Road (both Grade II)

These two buildings each appear as detached palazzos in a grand civic classical idiom, each over three-storeys. The five-bay former County Court building is now in use as commercial legal offices. Number 52 is six-bays and was previously a bank. Both buildings date from the 1860s, contemporary with the extension of Grainger Street down towards the railway station.

3.1.3 19-25 Grainger Street (Grade II)

This grand corner palazzo block was built as a branch of the Trustee Savings Bank and designed by J.E. Watson. It dates to 1863, again as above, to the extension of Grainger Street. The building presents five bays to Westgate Road on its south elevation, centred on a suitably prominent pediment supported by Ionic columns. The five-three-five of the Grainger Street is similarly detailed, with a central pediment containing the motto ‘INDUSTRY’.

---

4 Buildings of England: Northumberland, p447-8
3.1.4 Church of St John the Baptist (Grade I)

The Church of St John the Baptist predominantly dates from the 14th and 15th century, with the tower on Grainger Street of the latter date.

Figure 49 St John’s in the context of Grainger Street, Google

3.1.5 30 Grainger Street (Grade II)

An “exuberant use of French Renaissance style”5 edifice dating from the 1880s, designed by John Johnstone for the Newcastle and Gateshead Gas Company (see figure 11).

3.1.6 34 – 50 Grainger Street (all Grade II)

This line of Italianate and Jacobean commercial buildings all date to 1874. Nos 42-50 were designed by Matthew Thomson for Sir Walter Scott.

3.1.7 53-61 Grainger Street, Chaucer Buildings (Grade II)

This is a good example of a multi-use development of the 19th century, comprising shops, offices and a Freemasons’ Hall. Probably by Gibson Kyle, c1869, the building contributes further architectural variety with its Venetian Gothic style.

3.1.8 2-20 Newgate Street

Figure 50 2-20 Newgate Street. S&B

5 Ibid. p455
This smart range of Grainger-developed shops and houses date from the 1830s are, along with much of Grainger Town, probably designed by John Wardle. They announce the division between Grainger Town proper and the 1860s cuckoo-in-the-nest that is the south extension of Grainger Street.

3.1.9 69 & 71 Clayton Street (Grade II)
These are grouped with 67 Clayton Street and are similar four-storey three-bay blocks, probably also by John Wardle c1837, with modern ground floor shopfronts. The façade of 69 is in a poorer condition than its neighbours, and has been repainted. The fenestration of this block is also modern.

3.1.10 85 - 107 Clayton Street (Grade II)
Again probably by John Wardle, c 1837, these fronts continue the line of original Grainger architecture southwards towards the junction with Fenkle Street. Many are in good condition with unpainted ashlar and original, or at least sympathetic replacement fenestration. Whilst all have replacement shopfronts, it is interesting to note that some have the apparently original ground-floor layout with the front entrance to the house above to one side of a slightly off-centre shop-front, as shown in the 'as existing' plan of 67 Clayton Street in figure 15. Like number 67, many of these were early casualties of the increasing commercialisation of the street in the later 19th century. Number 87 was refaced in 1870.

3.1.11 Rose & Crown Public House, Newgate Street (Locally Listed)
The Rose & Crown was built around 1914 for Duncan and Dalgleish on the site of an earlier pub. It is two storeys plus an attic high. It has a good front with original character preserved down to street level which is not the case elsewhere. The lower level has blue glazed tiles and two pilaster surmounted by lions. The upper level has five windows under a cornice. The parapet has a central Jacobean shaped gable.

3.1.12 73 - 75 Grainger Street (Locally Listed)
The building on the corner of Newgate Street and Grainger Street was built in 1870 by John Johnstone for J G Yard. It is three storeys high with an attic level above. It has mixed free-style detailing, partly Baroque, part Italian and part Renaissance. It has good quality detail and forms a very good transition around the corner. The building is badly served by the tall but blank fascia for Boots. This fascia is a prominent negative element in views along Grainger Street.
3.2 Summary

It has been shown in an analysis of the key views of the proposed redevelopment of the Newgate Centre by Devereux Architects that there is a potential positive impact on the surrounding built heritage. The hotel tower, which despite presenting an interesting historical narrative to this part of the city, is not one that is sympathetic to its surroundings. This concurs with references to the centre in the 1996 Conservation Area character assessment, Patterns of Experience: “large developments like the Newgate Centre have obliterated the historical scale and ‘grain’ of the area”6... “the Empire Theatre was demolished for the Swallow Hotel slab block set over the drab, low Newgate Shopping Centre, both of which are damaging to the medieval curve.”7 The replacement of this scheme has the potential to introduce a further chapter in the historical development of this part of Grainger Town which presents a rich variety of centuries, styles and building-use. As much of the development is within the city block, it is unlikely to have any affect on the appreciation of the surrounding streets, yet presents an opportunity to create a more attractive piece of urban realm for the surrounding buildings to look out on to, and for the public to enjoy.

---

6 North East Civic Trust, Patterns of Experience, paragraph 2.20
7 Ibid. paragraph 4.9.15
4.0 COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS

4.1 Other modernist developments in Tyneside

4.1.1 Swan House

The construction of this building, designed by the noted Scottish practice RMJM, and the demolition of the Royal Arcade to make way for Swan House and the surrounding roundabout continues to be one of the more controversial moves of the 1960s. Nevertheless, the refurbishment of Swan House, and its rebranding as 55° North, has demonstrated the potential ongoing viability of good-quality modernist buildings – in this case the conversion of a commercial office block for residential use.

4.1.2 Westgate House

This was a particularly controversial development immediately adjacent to the Union Club of 1877, was described by the Buildings of England guide as ‘unspeakably ugly and intrusive’. Nevertheless, it could be countered that the ‘splendid French chateau’ that is the Union Club could easily hold its own against its later neighbour. Whilst the demolition of Westgate House was welcomed by many in the city, the replacement of the building with an example of distinctly ordinary architecture is an unfortunate backward step in terms of the ongoing historical narrative of Newcastle’s built environment.

4.1.3 Central Library

Designed by one of Britain’s greatest architects of the 20th century, Basil Spence, the new Central Library was completed in 1968. It was intended as part of a wider redevelopment of the area, with the former Town Hall and Library adjacent being demolished to make way for John Dobson Street. Spence also envisaged a redevelopment and extension of the Laing Art Gallery, with a grand public arena being created at deck level between the two institutions, covering over John Dobson Street. This was never realised, and the deck level entrance to the Central Library remained awkwardly obsolete until the building, arguably one of Tyneside’s better examples of Post-war architecture, was unfortunately demolished in 2007 and replaced by the Ryder HKS-designed Charles Avison Building which now houses the Newcastle City Library.
4.1.4 Gateshead Car Park

Designed by Owen Luder, this is soon to be another unfortunate casualty of the current fashion to decry all buildings of the modernist-era. This famous, and indeed infamous example of Brutalism is celebrated and loathed in equal measure, yet presents an undeniably excellent example of that particular oeuvre.

4.2 Summary

In studying these examples, it quickly becomes clear that the Newgate development was not of an equivalent calibre. Whilst the above examples have all continued to be controversial - either as a result of their retention or demolition - apart from the initial anguish at the loss of Frank Matcham’s Empire Theatre, there has never been strong opinions voiced over the Newgate development, and it is unlikely that its loss would be mourned by many, if at all. The architects are not of the same calibre as RMJM, Luder or Spence, and the build quality of the hotel is not sufficient to warrant either restoration or refurbishment. The shopping centre has also been in an almost continuous attempt to keep pace with other larger retail developments in the city, yet it still fails to meet the expectations of today’s market.
5.0 ARCHITECTS' BIOGRAPHIES

5.1 John Wardle
John Wardle played an important part in designing the new streets and other buildings erected in Newcastle upon Tyne by Thomas Grainger in the 1830s. In the *Newcastle Journal* of 3 June 1837, it was stated that the central three ranges on the west side of Grey Street, the western half of Market Street, and Grainger Street were "entirely designed in Mr. Grainger's office by Mr. Wardle under Mr. Grainger's immediate directions". In addition Wardle is said in the same article to have designed the south side of Shakespeare Street. Wardle appears to have been Grainger's principal architectural designer, but of his earlier or subsequent career nothing is at present known. He died on 11 May 1860, aged 65.

5.2 Oliver & Leeson* (later Oliver Leeson & Wood)
Thomas Oliver Jr (b.1823-d.1902) and Richard John Leeson (d.1914) went into partnership in 1879. As well as working on theatres, they were general practice architects who designed churches, commercial buildings and schools.

5.3 Frank Matcham9
Frank Matcham was the most prolific theatre architect of his (or any other) time, responsible for the design or complete redesign of at least 120 theatres and variety palaces between 1879 and 1912 - and this figure takes no account of hundreds of improvement works which were less than total reconstructions. The full extent of Frank Matcham's output will probably never be established with certainty, but new research continues to add to the number of his known works.

Frank Matcham's decades of extraordinary productivity came to quite an abrupt end. He designed little or nothing after 1912. When he died at his home in Southend in 1920 the practice continued as Matcham & Co under his chief assistant F G M Chancellor, but the golden age Matcham had towered over died with him.

By 1975, around 85% of all the theatres which had existed in Britain before 1914 were destroyed or mutilated beyond recall, most of the destruction having occurred from 1950 onward. Only 24 of his entertainment houses now remain in more or less complete condition but these few are still regarded - in modern terms - as being amongst the best theatres we have.

5.4 Bernard Engle & Partners10
The Practice was formed in 1850 by William Young. William Young undertook many buildings of national interest during his career, most notably the Municipal Buildings in Glasgow and the War Office in Whitehall.

Clyde Young joined his father's Practice at the beginning of this century, initially to continue work on the War Office. During this period the other commissions of

---

*Information supplied by David Wilmore.
9Information supplied by John Earl
10Information from Engle Architects Website: www.engle.co.uk/practice_information/history.html
interest were the Indian Hall, Westbury Manor, University College at Southampton and the Imperial Service College and Chapel at Windsor.

Bernard Engle was born in Hamburg. In the early 1920s he studied architecture at the Munich TH, then in 1925 he worked in New York with Ernest Flagg before joining his father’s architectural practice in Hamburg. In 1935 he came to England where he joined in practice with Clyde Young, with whom he designed a number of private houses and retail developments in London and Paris. After the war the Practice undertook a major conversion of houses into flats at Hyde Park Gardens; the new main staircase at the National Liberal Club; the Vauxhall Gardens at the Festival of Britain; the Margaret MacMillan College in Bradford and the headquarters of the Civic Service Clerical Association in Balham. Following Clyde Young’s retirement the Practice adopted Bernard Engle’s name.

Bernard Engle Architects & Planners enjoyed a period of major growth and underwent a change of direction in the sixties. The appointment to redevelop Bradford City Centre was the first in a series of commissions which established the Practice as one of the leading firms in the country. New civic centres in Droylsden and Barrow-in-Furness as well as the numerous town centre redevelopments, including Burnley, Lewisham, Salisbury and Staines, reinforced this position. The Practice was also responsible for the first major edge-of-town retail complex at Brent Cross, which set a new direction in retail development.
6.0 CONDITION
6.1 Condition and Repairs

The front is a three bay front over four stories. It is built of sandstone ashlar. The storeys are divided by moulded band courses. Between the second and third floor is a full cornice. This is fairly unusual in this part of Clayton Street for retaining its original moulding profiles. The upper storey is expressed as an attic with a further cornice above.

The masonry is of fair appearance. A significant number of the original stones survive. The building appears to have been cleaned by abrasion techniques. Most of the pointing survives but is probably not the original campaign of pointing.

About 30-50% of the front of the building has been repaired by cutting back original stone and covering with cement based mortar repairs. This work appears to have been carried out in more than one campaign. There is earlier work towards the head of the front, particularly at cornice level, which has a brown colour and which has been worked to the same joint lines as original stones. Although not in the long-term interests of the condition of the stone, the mortar repairs have been carried out with some care and to a reasonable colour match to the cleaned masonry. Its replacement is therefore not urgent until the mortar repair starts cracking which would indicate evidence of loss of adhesion to its stone backing. There seems to have been a later campaign of stone replacement adjacent to the building to the south. This comprises seven stones. The colour is a poorer match but the mortar seems as secure as the other mortar repairs.

There are some specific repairs required to the front;
- Remove and point up overflow pipes at third floor level within masonry,
- Rake out and repoint joints at upper and lower cornices,
- Remove metal fixing and six bolts, repair masonry and repoint,
- At string course between first and second floors – make mortar repair at damaged stone at north end, remove overflow or tie point at south end and point over.

Both upper and lower cornices have obvious staining. This staining would be prevented or at least reduced by fitting lead cappings to the cornices as has been carried out on buildings to the same design further south on the same side of Clayton Street.

It is desirable to remove electrical accretions such as the ABEL alarm box, the electrical junction box and all cabling. Where fixings are removed they should be repointed using lime mortar tinted to match the colour of the stone.

At the base of the first floor above the shop front there is a panel of render. The redesign of this area should be considered as part of the shop front. The front two plots south (Big ‘n’ Beautiful) offers an appropriate precedent. The moulding at the head of the adjacent shop front (British Heart Foundation) was probably intended to be continued across the front of 67 Clayton Street. The pilaster between this building and the adjacent building to the south was also intended to be returned into the shop front and this sets the appropriate height for the soffit of the beam across the head of the shop front. The pilaster should be replicated at the north end of the shop front.
The windows are all timber. They may not be the original sashes but they are an appropriate replacement if not original. The sash pattern is three over three at third floor level, three over six at second floor level and six over six at first floor level. All windows should be overhauled to full working order, including appropriate ironmongery. Sills should be inspected in detail. Where sills are rotten, part replacement using hardwood would be appropriate.

All external joinery above the shop front should be painted. The colour used should be a white or off-white. White was probably not the original colour used in the Clayton Street development but it would be architectural bad manners to use a different colour now that white has been established as the external joinery colour for Grainger Town.

The roof structure should be examined. If the roof structure is found to pre-date the 20th century it should be retained in position. The roof finishes can not be seen from general street level. The front face of the roof should be on the same position and plane as the original. The pitch and relationship to the upper cornice should be replicated from other matching buildings on Clayton Street.
7.0 **IMPACT ASSESSMENT**

7.1 **Introduction**

The development will have an impact on one listed building – 67 Clayton Street – and as demolition of a substantial building within the Newcastle Central Conservation Area. The demolition site is adjacent to listed and locally listed buildings, and the proposed buildings will have to be appropriate to the context of the surrounding streets.

7.2 **Identification of Impact**

The impacts on heritage and conservation that are associated with this scheme can be listed as follows;

- Demolition of a building within a conservation area
- Alterations to a listed building - 67 Clayton Street
- Effects of new development on Clayton Street
- Effect of new building within Newgate Street
- Effect of new building on neighbouring building on Newgate Street (Rose Crown Public House)
- Effects of new façade to Grainger Street on neighbouring properties
- Effect of new façade on Grainger Street in general

7.3 **Evaluation of Significance**

The demolition of the shopping centre and hotel will be a very significant visual change within the conservation area. It will involve the loss of some substantial buildings that occupy a large and important block. The block is part of Grainger Town which is one of the most important urban developments of the 19th century in Britain. However, despite the loss of such a large amount of building fabric, the value of the buildings to be demolished is low - bordering on the negligible. The buildings have a negative quality on their surroundings and their proposed development will considerably improve the streetscape of Newgate Street and the views along surrounding streets. The loss of the hotel tower in particular is a benefit.

The building has some significance as part of the history of redevelopment within central Newcastle during the 1960s. It plays a minor part in the political and social history of 20th century planning. Newgate Street and the Swallow Hotel are not included in a current exhibition about T Dan Smith and the 1960s redevelopment of Newcastle.

Archaeological implications of the clearance of the site are discussed in a separate document.

The impact on the existing listed building contained within the development – 67 Clayton Street – is low. This is because the parts of this building that are considered to be significant, such as the tree storeys of ashlar faced stone façade above the ground floor shop, will not be altered by this scheme. Following comprehensive
internal alterations, the remaining significance of the building is entirely in its front façade. This front is significant as part of the original design of Clayton Street and as part of the Grainger Town development. Its significance is enhanced by the retention of the original window glazing bar pattern and mouldings. Some elements, such as the general condition, cement repairs to stones and various accretions, detract from the significance of the front of this building, as does the current shop front and fascia.

Although the significance of this element is moderate, the impact of the proposed alterations will be low.

The impact of the scheme on the Clayton Street streetscape will take two forms. The scheme will restore some elements of the regular surround to shop fronts which appears to have been consistent for the whole of this side of Clayton Street, including the pilasters and the moulding above the shop front. This is a minor but positive impact. It could have a positive longer-term impact in encouraging similar restoration of consistent shop front surrounds elsewhere along this street.

The larger impact will be the new building at the corner between Clayton Street and Newgate Street. This building will be of better and more appropriate appearance to the context of Clayton Street than the existing building. It will have window positions and mouldings which will line through with the listed building façade and it will be clad in stone. The impact in terms of change of appearance of this building will be marked. It will, however, be a positive impact because the architecture and materials of the replacement building are of higher quality than the building to be replaced.

The impact of the new building facing Newgate Street will be very considerable. This front represents an almost total change from the aesthetic of the existing building. The new building will be on an original building line of the block before the 1960s redevelopment. The consistent height of the proposed buildings is much closer to a typical Newcastle block than the lower than normal level of the shopping centre blocks and the higher than usual level of the hotel block. The impact is significant but it does remove the existing architectural solution which had a much greater impact when it was built because it was essentially alien to the general appearance and historic development of the Grainger Town blocks. The significance of the impact of the proposed elevation to Newgate Street is therefore relatively low because it will produce an elevation treatment which is more in keeping with the originally intended arrangement than the building to be demolished.

The impact on the locally listed buildings of the Rose & Crown and the building on the corner of Newgate Street and Grainger Street is less than the impact on the Newgate Street streetscape in general. The Rose & Crown elevation is an attractive, architecturally robust and self contained elevation. Before the demolition of the Empire Theatre, and construction of the Newgate Shopping Centre, it was considerably smaller than both its neighbours to east and west. This was possibly also the case between this building and the building which preceded the Empire Theatre. The relationship between the Rose & Crown and the new building is therefore appropriate even despite the difference in height. It reflects a previous arrangement on this site. The relationship to the locally listed building at the corner would also have minimal impact. There are changes in level between this corner building, the Rose & Crown and the proposed building but this character of different heights is not necessarily out of character with the streetscape as it descends towards
the Bigg Market. A similar arrangement of different heights is evident on the opposite side of Newgate Street.

The impact of the new front to Grainger Street on the neighbouring properties is relatively small. It means that a building which was typical of the 1960s but regarded as relatively poor quality will be replaced by a building characteristic of the first decade of the 21st century and of a higher quality of design and materials. The architecture of the buildings along this side of Grainger Street is particularly strong. Each plot has been individually designed to look its best without particular regard for its neighbour. There is a happy coincidence of Gothic styles between some of the plots. All of the buildings are faced with stone. This elevation of Grainger Street is of fine appearance because each plot has been designed as a high quality design according to the principles and taste of the day when it was designed. This same principle should apply to a new building on the Newgate development site.

The character of the Grainger Street elevation to the south of the proposal site also benefits from the near coincidence of horizontal lines particularly at the sill levels of the first and second floor and, to a lesser extent, at cornice and parapet level.

The impact of the new elevation in the streetscape of Grainger Street will be relatively minimal because the existing building is not particularly prominent at oblique angles along the street. The streetscape will be improved by the better quality architecture than the existing arrangement.

7.4 Mitigation

The main mitigation involved in all parts of the building involving demolition of the existing Newgate Centre and hotel should be in recording these buildings. Copies of survey plans, of the heritage statement and a photographic record of the buildings should be given to National Monuments Record, to local archives and to local history collection. A photographic record should include photographs of all existing elevations, including rear elevations, photographs within the shopping centre arcades, photographs of the public spaces within the hotel and of the typical bedrooms. Photographs should include views of the building in context, for instance from a distance from St John’s Church and showing how the building appears within the streetscape. The photographs should be in sufficient detail to make a clear record of building materials.

Where sandstone has been chosen as the cladding material, it should be carefully specified to match the weathering characteristics, colour and variety of the stone used in the original blocks against Clayton Street.

The mitigation for the alteration to the existing listed building facing Clayton Street will be the repair of the façade.

Accretions should be removed, such as metal plates and their fixing bolts, cables, alarm boxes. Where fixings of damaged masonry leave holes, it should be pointed up. It is not necessary to carry out substantial stone replacement. Possibly only at the stones which have been poorly tinted towards the southern end of the string course between the first and second floors should be replaced. Windows should be overhauled and repaired. Leaded flashings over both upper and lower cornices will reduce the unsightly staining pattern.
The shop front surround should be reinstated, including pilasters to match other pilasters on Clayton Street and by continuing across the moulding at the head of the shop front to match the precedent of neighbouring property but with its upper line to match the upper line of the block to plots further south on Clayton Street. The exterior and interior of this building should be recorded in photographs before work starts.

The return elevation of the new block to the west of the Rose & Crown should be carefully considered. It is likely that previous blocks on this site would have had a blank gable visible at an oblique angle in views from the east above the roofline of the Rose & Crown. A blank gable is probably also appropriate in the current arrangement although the quality and consistency of materials will be an important consideration in westwards views along Newgate Street.

The block facing Grainger Street to be demolished should be recorded as part of the general recording exercise as noted above. Mitigation is provided in the quality of the materials and in the care taken to continue important horizontal lines on the Grainger Street buildings to the south across the elevation of the new block at the same level.

7.5 Residual Impacts

The main residual impact is that external materials of the new building should weather in the same way as the existing buildings. Projecting courses should be introduced at wall heads, sills, and other horizontal lines throughout the elevations to avoid ugly patterns of water staining.

The proper reinstatement of original moulded lines around the shop front on Clayton Street could be part of a general trend towards reinstatement of all pilasters and cornices on the original buildings within Clayton Street.

7.6 Summary

The impact of the development is entirely neutral or positive. The conservation area will benefit from the replacement of the Newgate shopping centre and hotel building although they should be recorded before demolition. The record is largely for reasons of political and social history rather than a record of the aesthetic qualities of the buildings.

It is considered that the architectural design of the proposals will be both an improvement on the quality of the existing buildings and more appropriate to the character of the Grainger town blocks in terms of scale, continuity with the existing buildings, materials and massing.

The project offers benefits in terms of conservation of a listed building because it includes the repair of 67 Clayton Street, the reinstatement of the Clayton Street pattern of shop front surrounds and an improved shop front.
8.0 RECOMMENDATIONS

Recommendations are in the form of guidelines and parameters for the nature of a redevelopment.

8.1 Key Recommendations

- 67 Clayton Street should be repaired externally and internally.
- Alteration work to 67 Clayton Street should be sensitive to the surviving significant element – the stone facade.
- The hotel and shopping centre which have been established as having negative or neutral significance could be demolished without loss of historic or aesthetic significance.
- All structures should be recorded in photographs before work starts and during demolition.
- Development should be sensitive to the adjacent buildings on Newgate, Clayton and Grainger Streets.
- Development should be sensitive to the streetscape and building form of the Grainger Town blocks.

8.2 Retention of Significance

The site contains one listed building, 67 Clayton Street, and is next to one locally listed building.

Apart from the listed building, none of the buildings on the site are considered to have anything more than minor significance. In the case of the shopping centre buildings this significance is in terms of social and political history rather than architectural aesthetics.

8.3 Further Research

Basic archive research and consultation has been carried out for this study. More detailed study is possible if another research source is available. This might include the records of the architects, Engle.

8.4 Physical Evidence and Recording

The inspection carried out for this report did not involve any opening up. It is possible that more evidence of the original interior form and decorative finishes is preserved underneath later, less significant finishes.

It is recommended that, following the departure of the tenant of 67 Clayton Street, a stripping out contract should be carried out within the interior. This stripping out contract would allow the removal of non-significant later fabric to be controlled. The interior fabric should be assessed for its significance and parts with no significance should be taken away so that any evidence behind it can be revealed and recorded.

The assessment and recording should be carried out by an experienced archaeologist or buildings historian. The results should be made publicly available i.e. by inclusion in the National Monuments Record.
The 1960s buildings are considered to have minor significance but should be recorded in drawings and photographs before and during alteration or demolition.

8.5 Repairs
Repairs should be carried out to the façade of 67 Clayton Street as identified in the paragraphs marked condition above.

8.6 Interventions: New Shop Front
The design of interventions should respect the significance of the existing building. It should be innately attractive but it should not be intrusive to aesthetic or historical appreciation.

The design should respect the existing fabric of the building. The interface between a new element and the existing fabric must be carefully considered to avoid damage to the existing building, for instance by differential erosion or by damage at fixing points. The alteration should be reversible.

Interventions should be carefully considered to be in sympathy with the existing structure or feature in terms of design and materials. This does not mean, however, that an intervention or extension should necessarily replicate elements of the existing structure. Interventions should be clearly identifiable as such, both physically, by dating, and by documenting the construction and alteration process. The interventions throughout a building should have common character so that they can be interpreted as being part of a single datable campaign of alteration.

The materials used in interventions should be of good quality and long lasting.

8.7 The Design of New Buildings
The design of buildings in close association with existing buildings of significance always requires particular architectural knowledge, judgment, skill and care. There will be many appropriate ways of designing new buildings on this site but some basic criteria can be applied.

The new buildings should not damage, mask or devalue the façade of 67 Clayton Street. They should be of appropriate quality and should complement the existing significant structures on the site.

New buildings can be carefully matched, blended or contrasted with the existing buildings but in all cases they should combine to form a composite building or group of buildings of overall architectural and visual integrity. Even when a particular approach is judged to satisfy all the relevant criteria, the success of the development as a whole will depend on the fine detail, and on the skill and aesthetic sensitivity with which it is carried out.

The design of new buildings should not be perceived as an end in itself, to be regarded in isolation. The composite building group should be of appropriate quality throughout and should have architectural integrity as a whole within the streetscape. The component parts should be maintainable and should be expected to age, weather and generally to grow together.

The height of new buildings immediately adjacent to existing buildings should
generally be no greater than the height of the existing buildings although it is
recognised that the Rose & Crown will be much lower than the neighbouring
development, as it was when the Empire Theatre was next door. This
recommendation would establish a general height but a broken roof line would be
less intrusive than very strong horizontal lines on Newgate and Grainger Streets.
Some parts of the roof line could pass above the level of the existing buildings
without detracting from the character of the block.

Building materials are likely to be the main difference between the existing buildings
and new construction. Natural materials of high quality are proposed with a mix of
composite materials. The listed building and all adjacent buildings are faced with
sandstone. The Rose & Crown has blue tiles.

Materials could be derived from the significant buildings on site and from the
surrounding buildings:

• Sandstone, formed or clad in ashlar courses, yellow/buff sandstone with
  some gradation in texture and iron staining. Some stone surfaces could be
tooled rather than left plain,
• Tile
• Metal or timber window frames,
• Slate,
• Painted timber windows and doors,
• Framed glazing,
• Metal gutters and down pipes.

However, this does not exclude other materials commonly and successfully used in
contemporary design. Materials such as cast or reconstituted stone, reconstituted
slate, concrete tiles, UPVC gutters or windows are all considered to be of too poor
quality to be used on this site or within a conservation area.

A contemporary palette of materials is not excluded but it must be of high quality
and bear some relationship to the materials of the buildings around the site.

It is desirable that there should be some apparent compatibility between the
weathering of the new materials and the old. This can be achieved by designing the
same degree of protection by cornices and other over-projecting detailing, although
this need not replicate original mouldings.

The detailing of the new buildings will depend on the material chosen. If the new
buildings contain detailing which refers in any way to the mouldings and other
architectural form of the existing building, this detail must be handled very carefully.
If details are to be repeated as a reference to the existing building, then they should
be repeated accurately to avoid the feeling of pastiche. Accurate reproduction would
include choice of the same stone, the same stone sizes, and an exact copy of
mouldings and joint positions and widths. The relationships between detailed
decorative features should also be understood.

It is possible to design successful detailing which relates to the original, either in size,
position, heights, or by lining through horizontally with the existing building but
which is expressed quite differently.
The architectural response which is least likely to be acceptable is a design between these two positions which involves an approximation of historic detailing without an understanding of its purpose or construction.

It is not essential, and possibly not desirable, that the new buildings are precisely symmetrical. However, a balanced or symmetrical disposition of elements would be a reasonable response to the character of the surrounding streets and in particular to Clayton Street.